- 1 Q. I'm sorry, detective. Prior to you seeing this
 2 tape, you testified earlier and also at the grand
 3 jury that the first tape was from the back of the
 4 room; is that correct?
- A. Well, the first tape I saw -- well, which part are you asking me about?
- Q. Well, when you investigated the alleged crime originally, when you went to answer the first tape, you saw -- you testified that it was from the back; that the camera was behind; isn't that true?
- 12 A. I don't know which position you're asking me
 13 about. There's one part where they're going down
 14 the hallway where the camera is from the back.
- 15 | Q. That's what you testified to?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. Yes, because you knew this was available. This new tape wasn't available then?
- 19 A. No, sir, it was not.
- 20 Q. Have you seen this new tape?
- 21 A. Yes, sir, I have.
- Q. And it clearly shows them walking? You have a frontal view now, correct?
- 24 A. Yes, sir, you do.
- 25 Q. Was there any dragging in this tape?

I didn't see any dragging, sir. 1 2 Q. Any pushing? I didn't see any pushing, no. 3 Α. Was there any -- was the alleged victim trying to 4 Ο. 5 stop at any time? I didn't observe that. 6 Α. You didn't observe that. Is it your testimony 7 they're just freely walking down into this room, 8 9 correct? I wouldn't testify that she was freely brought 10 Α. 11 down to the room. 12 MR. ARDITO: Your Honor, may I show 13 this tape? 14 THE COURT: Sure. Do you want it at this point, or do you want it when this 15 officer -- at this point or when this officer is 16 17 completed? Do you want it now? MR. ARDITO: Well, I'd like to have him 18 19 testify to what --20 THE COURT: Okay. 21 MS. VEENSTRA: It might be clearer, 22 your Honor. 23 THE COURT: All right. 24 MS. VEENSTRA: I'd ask that this be 25 marked as Exhibit 2.

1 THE COURT: Okay. 2 (The tape was marked Exhibit No. 2 and received into evidence.) 3 THE OFFICER: There's no volume on 4 5 this. 6 MR. ARDITO: I'm sorry? 7 THE OFFICER: There's no volume. 8 MR. ARDITO: Actually there was some 9 conversation. 10 (The tape was played). Detective, do you know whose voice that is in the 11 Q. 12 background? 13 Ά. No, I do not. 14 Do you know who put that soda there? 15 It appears to be Heather Kiernan in one of the Α. 16 voices appears to be her. And does it appear that there are more than two 17 Q. voices? Who is that? 18 19 Α. Heather Kiernan. 20 MR. ARDITO: Your Honor, I just -- the 21 detectives then do some further work. 22 repeat of what was visually depicted, and I'll leave that for the Court to view. 23 24 THE COURT: Okay. Did you have questions now? 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. ARDITO: Well, I believe this is another shot of what took place. You see them walking. THE COURT: What? MR. ARDITO: This is another of the stroll down the -- right here. Can you stop that? Sorry, judge. MS. VEENSTRA: Would you like me to rewind it just a little bit? THE COURT: Yeah. MS. VEENSTRA: It appears to depict some shadows and then the two walking down the hallway. THE COURT: Right. Okay. When they get in the frame, if you can stop it there. THE OFFICER: Pause? THE COURT: Okay. Counsel, you have questions? MR. ARDITO: Thank you, judge. Where is Mr. Ciambriello's left arm in this Q. photograph? By his side. Α. Not around her body as you earlier testified? Q. I had testified that her right hand -- that his Α. right arm was around her body.

- Q. And did you not say that his left arm appeared to be around her?
 - A. No. I testified that in the shot where they went through the money room, that I couldn't see -from what I recall of that tape, I couldn't see his left hand. So, it would lead me to believe that it was towards the right-hand side of his body. It wasn't down by his side like it is here.
- 10 Q. Clearly it was by his side when they walked in?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 | Q. No struggle to your --
- 13 A. No.

4

5

6

7

8

9

17

18

19

- MR. ARDITO: Okay. No further questions, judge.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. Ms. Veenstra.

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. VEENSTRA:

- Q. Detective Otrando, is this the money room?
- A. No. From my understanding, I may be wrong, but the money room is the initial -- I think it was just before this, that door that opened. I said -- when I spoke about the money room was when the camera was up here high. Mr.
- Ciambriello had his right arm around her side,

and they were walking through that -- by that

camera. Then they went through a door, down this

long hallway. That's the long hallway that I saw

from the back on that second camera. I don't

believe that's the money room. I could be

mistaken.

- Q. Okay. And the other portion of this tape, sergeant, which appears to show the alleged victim drinking a soda; do you know when in time that was with regard to the alleged rape? Do you know if that was before or after the alleged rape?
- 13 | A. I'm not sure. I'd have to check.
- 14 | Q. The time?
- 15 A. Yeah.

7

8

9

10

11

- MS. VEENSTRA: May I, your Honor?

 THE COURT: You may.
- 18 Q. Do you see --
- A. In the lower right hand corner it says 1900. So,

 I would have to say that would be after the

 incident.
- Q. And would it be fair to say that the alleged victim was working alongside of the defendant at that time?
- 25 A. That's correct.

- Q. Did it appear from information you received that there were employees that actually delivered money to that location after the alleged incident?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- Q. Is it your belief that that is what is depicted on that portion of this tape?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 MS. VEENSTRA: I have no further 10 questions.
- MR. ARDITO: Just brief recross.

RECROSS EXAMINATION

13 BY MR. ARDITO:

- 14 Q. Detective, you interviewed my client, correct?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- Q. And in interviewing him, you noticed he has a very heavy heavy Italian accent; is that true?
- 18 A. Yes.

- Q. And you heard a voice besides the alleged victim on that tape; isn't that true? Another voice just now?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. And that other voice wasn't Mr. Ciambriello, correct? There was a third voice?
- 25 A. I heard two other male voices.

1	Q.	Two other males voices, correct? And you're
2		saying you're testifying that this based on
3		the time took place after the alleged assault,
4		correct?
5	Α.	Yes, from the time, yes.
6		MR. ARDITO: All right. No further
7		questions, your Honor.
8		THE COURT: Okay. Thank you very
9		much. You may step down.
10		THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor.
11		MS. VEENSTRA: The Commonwealth would
12		call Christopher Markey.
13		THE COURT: Okay.
14	İ	CHRISTOPHER MARKEY, Sworn
15		THE WITNESS: Morning, your Honor.
16		DIRECT EXAMINATION
17	BY	MS. VEENSTRA:
18	Q.	Could you please state your name for the record?
19	A.	Christopher Markey, M-A-R-K-E-Y.
20	Q.	How are you employed?
21	Α.	I'm an assistant district attorney for Bristol
22		County.
23	Q.	I'd like to direct your attention to the month of
24		May in the year 2001 and ask you whether you had
25		an opportunity to review an alleged rape

- regarding a defendant Francesco Ciambriello?
- 2 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. And do you know who the lead investigator was on that case?
- 5 A. Detective John Otrando from the Attleboro Police 6 Department.
- 7 Q. And at some point did you receive information
 8 from Sergeant Otrando regarding information
 9 regarding some surveillance tapes at the location
 10 of the alleged rape?
- 11 A. Yes.
- Q. Were you aware of whether some of that
 surveillance activity had already been viewed by
 Sergeant Otrando?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And how did you know that?
- 17 A. I believe he made mention of it to me, and I said
 18 that we needed to get -- we should get someone -19 we should get those tapes and obtain the tapes.
- Q. And at some point do you know if Sergeant Otrando seized some tapes initially in the investigation?
- A. I'm unsure if he seized them right off the bat,
 but I know I had conversation with him to get
 more tapes or get tapes; but he may have had some
 right then that we were making plans. I'm not

1 sure of that.

- And at some point did you have some communication 2 with defense counsel Mr. Ardito regarding viewing 3 4 some tapes?
- 5 Α. Yes, I did.

10

11

12

- And were some arrangements made to meet with 6 Q. 7 counsel to look at those tapes?
- We made arrangements to have him view the tapes 8 Α. at our office in New Bedford at 888 Purchase 9 Street on the fifth floor because we have some video equipment that we can use to look at tapes.
 - At some point did you receive some tapes from Ο. Sergeant Otrando?
- 14 I believe I went to the Attleboro Police Α. Yes. Department, picked those up, and brought those 15 16 back to New Bedford.
- 17 Do you know how many you seized? Q.
- 18 I believe I had two or three. Α.
- 19 And you brought those back to New Bedford for the Ο. purpose of trying to view those on equipment that 20 21 the district attorney's office had?
- 22 I was waiting. I made arrangements with Α. 23 Mr. Otrando -- I mean the attorney for the defendant to do it some afternoon I believe it 24 25 was.

- 1 | Q. And did you in fact attempt to do that?
- 2 A. Yes. Mr. Ardito came down, went to my office,
- and then two offices away is the video room where
- 4 | we would have that equipment. We went in there.
- We put the tape in, and we didn't have the proper
- 6 equipment to view it. Everything was kind of
- going really fast. As a result of that, I think
- 8 Mr. Ardito stayed for a little bit longer to view
- and see if he could make any adjustment. I
- 10 remember I was doing something else in my
- office. So, I just went to my office for a
- 12 little bit, and then Mr. Ardito came over, and we
- just -- he said, "It's not going to work." I
- 14 said, "Okay. We'll go up to the armored car
- place and view the tapes there, and we'll make
- arrangements there."
- 17 Q. And that would be to view those tapes on the
- actual equipment that it was taped on?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. And so, your attempts to view it at the district
- 21 attorney's office were unsuccessful?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 Q. And Mr. Ardito left?
- A. Mr. Ardito left. I kept the tapes, and then I
- 25 went to Attleboro District Court office and -- or

1 our office. I think we were trying to make 2 arrangements to watch the video with Mr. Ardito again because at that point it was going to be my 3 case; and what happened was I don't think --4 there was some mix-up in communication between 5 the two of us, and we didn't go that afternoon. 6 I kept the tapes there. I gave them to Assistant 7 District Attorney Chris Saunders. I said, "Look, 8 9 I can't -- I'm not going to come back up here. Why don't you look at the tapes", because he was going to end up doing the probable cause hearing. And I left them in the Attleboro District Court office. And that would have been two, maybe three tapes? Q.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- A. Two, maybe three tapes, and that was some time if I remember correctly in the Summer of 2001.
- Q. And you said that the purpose of that was so that Christopher Saunders could then meet defense counsel at the facility, the work place facility?
- A. That's right. What happened in the meantime was it was decided that Chris was going to actually -- Chris Saunders was going to actually handle the case. It was going to be his first Superior Court case. He was going to do the probable cause hearing and do everything. Some

time towards the end of Summer of 2001 we made that decision. So, I said, "Just you keep it and handle the case."

THE COURT: When you said you left the tapes in the Attleboro District Court office, that's the DA's office?

THE WITNESS: Yeah, that's right. At 120 North Main Street.

- Q. And did you have some conversation with Mr. Saunders about the fact he would be handling the case?
- A. I did, and I said that he would be handling it.

 I had talked to his supervisor, and he said it would be fine for him to handle it; and at that point, you know, I'd check up on it once in a while. Hey, what's going on with this case? And then at some point, I don't know when it was, but I know when the case was pending, the defendant either became ill or was involved in some accident, and they continued the case over for a significant amount of time because of a serious injury to the defendant. I remember that. But that's basically how I remember ending it at that point.
- Q. And do you know whether Chris Saunders ever

viewed those tapes with defense counsel at AMSA?

- A. I don't know if he ever viewed it. I heard later that Chris Abreu had viewed the tapes, and he's another assistant DA attorney who worked in the Attleboro District Court. That's the last --
- Q. Now, did you ever receive those two or three tapes back?
- 8 A. No.

2

3

4

5

6

7

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 9 Q. Did you ever take possession of any other tapes seized by the Attleboro Police Department?
- 11 A. No.
- Q. Would it be fair to say that some time in June of 2002, the case was assigned to me to prosecute?
- 14 A. Excuse me?
- 15 Q. Would it be fair to say --
- 16 A. Yes, it was. For you, yes.
- Q. Can you report, Mr. Markey, whether a diligent search of your office has been able to turn up those tapes?
 - A. I went through every box and every unmarked video that I have in my office to check to see if it could be any relation to this case, and the videos that I viewed and went through did not have any correspondence to this case.

MS. VEENSTRA: I have no further

1 questions of this witness. 2 THE COURT: Mr. Ardito. 3 MR. ARDITO: Very briefly, judge. 4 Thank you. 5 CROSS EXAMINATION 6 BY MR. ARDITO: The last time you saw the tapes was when you 7 delivered them to the Attleboro district 8 attorney's office, correct? 9 10 Α. That's correct. And you yourself never viewed the tapes in your 11 Q. 12 office, correct? The only -- I think I did for about two minutes 13 Α. 14 when we -- you and I were sitting there in that 15 office; and all it did was kept -- you couldn't understand anything on it. 16 17 MR. ARDITO: No further questions. 18 MS. VEENSTRA: No further questions of 19 this witness. 20 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Markey. 21 THE WITNESS: Thank you, judge. 22 MS. VEENSTRA: At this time, your Honor, I would offer an affidavit of Christopher 23 24 Saunders. He was unavailable today due to a 25 medical appointment.

- 1 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. And for how long were you employed with the DA's office?
- A. For approximately five years from 1997 to 2002, September.
- Q. And at some point were you assigned to the
 Attleboro District Court district attorney's
 office?
- 9 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. And do you know your approximate time of service for that office?
- 12 A. I was there for approximately seven months, and I
 13 believe I left in February of 2002 and was
 14 transferred to New Bedford.
- Q. And at some point during your time with the
 Attleboro District Court district attorney's
 office, did you become aware of a case that was
 pending, Commonwealth vs. Francesco Ciambriello?
- 19 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. And at some point were you asked to assist
 Assistant District Attorney Saunders?
- 22 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. And can you describe that to the Court, please?
- A. Well, I believe it was a day where ADA Saunders
 had a trial, and my trials had pled out. So, he

- asked me if I would simply go view a tape at an armored car employment place.
- Q. And were there some specific plans as to who was supposed to go to that facility?
- A. Yes. I was told that Attorney Ardito would be there and also the security supervisor would be there to watch the tapes with us.
- Q. And did you receive some tapes to bring to that location?
- 10 A. I believe so, yes.
- 11 Q. Do you recall how many tapes you received?
- 12 A. I want to say at least two, maybe more than two.
- 13 | Q. Do you believe it was as many as six?
- 14 \mid A. Possibly. It's tough to say. But more than two.
- 15 | Q. More than --
- 16 A. Maybe three.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall whether those tapes were labeled in any way?
- 19 A. I do recall that they were labeled with letters
 20 in black marker, I believe, with a circle around
 21 it.
- Q. Did you in fact go to AMSA and meet with defense counsel for the purpose of viewing the tapes?
- 24 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. And you brought the tapes with you?

- 1 Α. Yes.
- Did you meet a member or an employee of AMSA at 2
- 3 that location?
- 4 Α. Yes, I did.
- 5 Do you remember his name? Q.
- I believe it was O'Brien, but I'm not totally 6 Α. 7 sure.
- Okay. Do you remember what he looked like? 8 Q.
- 9 White male. I'd say in his late thirties, Α.
- possibly thinning hair, maybe glasses, 180 10
- 11 pounds.

- And was he able to assist you in viewing those 12 Q. tapes with counsel? 13
- 14 Α. We went into the -- like it was a viewing room where all the cameras were, and we put a few 15 video tapes in and did watch some segments of the 16 17 tapes.
- 18 As best you can recall, can you describe what was Q. depicted on the tapes that you saw at AMSA?
- 20 From my recollection, the beginning of the tapes Α. 21 were basically a male and a female sitting down.
- It seemed like they were doing some work in a 22 23 room, and you really couldn't hear anything on the tapes. And that was for a lengthy period of 24

25 I don't recall, but it was more than an time.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

hour possibly. And at some point in time, they get up. And what we had to do was you had to change different views of the cameras because each camera was actually on the screen. So, we'd be watching one segment. That would be them sitting down. And there would be noise, and you really didn't hear anything, but you'd just see some movement. And then we would ask to see another angle of the camera, and then that camera angle would come up. So, at one point in time they did get up from original location where they were talking. You didn't hear anything. then they walked into a hallway. And I do recall when they entered that hallway, I recall the female saying, "I don't want to go back there." I also recall the male had his hand not so much around her waist, but towards her backside, walking with her. And I recall that he did have a firearm tucked in the belt in his back.

- Q. So, your view of the walking of the hallway as best you can describe it, is that a forward view, a backward view, or a combination with side? As best you can describe it.
- A. The view that I remember is it's -- the view was going forward down the hallway, and they were

- entering the hallway, and that's how I could see
 his hand placement and also see the firearm
 tucked in the back of his pants.
- Q. And when you say that it was tucked in the back of his pants, is that in the back, or on the side, or --
- 7 A. It was just tucked into the back of his belt area.
- 9 Q. Would that be on his left side or his right side?
- 10 A. I recall his left side.
- Q. And when you say that he was walking down the hallway with her, where was her body positioned?
 Was it on his right side or his left side?
- 14 | A. She was on his right side.
- Q. And you said that you heard some words uttered?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. Did you -- were you able to see any specific facial expressions or obvious signs of demeanor?
- 19 A. No, I don't recall that.
- 20 Q. On either the male or the female?
- 21 A. Yeah. Nothing.
- Q. Did you see what was depicted once they get down the hallway?
- A. They entered a room, but that's all that happened at that point. Once they entered the room, you

- didn't see anything. I was told there were no cameras in that room.
- Q. Okay. So, do you -- were you able to see how the door gets opened?
- 5 | A. I don't recall.
- Q. And did that door -- when you say that you can't see, you don't see anything after that? The door closes?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did at some point that door open?
- 11 A. Yes. I believe it was approximately five minutes
 12 after that. I believe it was like a short period
 13 of time. Maybe five minutes. The female exited
 14 first, and then the male exited some time after
 15 that.
- Q. Again, did you see -- were you able to, or do you recall any obvious signs of demeanor or facial expressions?
- 19 A. No.
- Q. On either of the two parties?
- A. No. It was just walking from that room, first the female and then later the male.
- 23 | Q. And were you able to hear anything on that tape?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 | Q. That portion of the tape?

1 A. No.

5

6

7

8

9

10

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. In viewing those tapes, did you have an opportunity to see anything that was depicted on the outside of the building?
 - A. Yes. I do recall the female and the male later smoking outside in the parking lot together.
 - Q. And do you know if that was later in time than what was -- according to the tape than what was depicted as them going into the room?
 - A. It was after the room. It was later in time.
- 11 Q. And you say that you saw who outside smoking?
- 12 A. The male and the female.
- 13 | Q. Anybody else?
 - A. Not at first. At first I believe if my recollection is correct, it was just the male and the female smoking outside. Then the male went inside again.

THE COURT: Was this the same male that you'd seen on the tape before?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

THE COURT: Okay.

THE WITNESS: And the male and female were outside smoking. At one point the male went inside. Then if my recollection is correct, another party actually went to that location. I

- saw a car pull up. There was some conversation, and later the female went back into the building.
- Q. And you said that another party arrived. Would that be male or female?
- 5 A. I don't recall. I just remember a car.
- Q. Did you see some interaction between the alleged victim and that party who arrived?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 | Q. Outside the building?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 | Q. And then the alleged victim returned inside?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Can you describe, if you can -- you went to the facility to view these tapes?
- 15 A. Yes.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: Ms. Veenstra, just for a second. You said you described some interaction between this person who arrived and the woman outside. What did you see?

THE WITNESS: It was just basically the female walking up to that car, and I don't recall if she went in the car or not, or if that person from that car got out to talk. I just remember some interaction taking place.

THE COURT: Okay.

- Q. Can you describe what, if any, security measures were in place that you became aware of that day?
 - A. Well, it was a very secure facility. That's one of the reason I actually remember going there and viewing it. Because you had to be buzzed in a couple of doors to get into the building. And they had cameras in numerous places around, and also I still remember that they had actually a fingerprint entry. To get into a certain room, you had to have the correct fingerprint to enter the room. It was a pretty secure facility.
 - Q. And now, do you recall seeing anything else depicted on the tapes during your viewing at AMSA?
- 15 A. Not that I recall.
- Q. And so, at some point yourself, counsel, and the employee of AMSA finished viewing those tapes; is that right?
- 19 A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

- 20 Q. And did you leave with those tapes?
- A. I don't recall. I believe that I would have left with the tapes. At the time the only reason I would have left the tapes there was to provide copies for the defense counsel and for the district attorney's office because at the time we

did not have the technology to make copies, but I 1 2 still don't think I would have done that. think I would have brought the tapes back to the 3 4 office, but I'm unsure. 5 So, you don't have a specific memory of what Ο. 6 happened to those tapes? 7 The only thing I remember is actually going Α. 8 there and viewing the tapes. 9 MS. VEENSTRA: I have no further 10 questions of this witness. 11 THE COURT: Mr. Ardito. 12 MR. ARDITO: Yes. 13 CROSS EXAMINATION 14 BY MR. ARDITO: 15 We viewed those tapes together, correct? Q. 16 Α. Yes. And we were there just about a couple of hours; 17 18 isn't that true? 19 Α. Yep, that's correct. 20 So, we really didn't get to see all the tapes? Ο. 21 Α. No, we did not. 22 You stated on the direct examination that another person pulled up, and there was some interaction? 23 24 Α. Correct. 25 Do you remember seeing on any of the tapes that

1 person inside the facility? 2. Α. I don't recall that. You testified on direct examination that before 3 Q. the alleged incident you saw Mr. Ciambriello and 4 the alleged victim sitting together working? 5 6 Α. Correct. During that period of time when you saw them 7 Ο. 8 sitting together working, did you see Mr. Ciambriello attack her in any way, shape, or 9 form? 10 I did not see any type of struggle taking place. 11 Α. 12 Do you recall seeing a video -- do you recall 13 seeing on the video some time after the alleged incident Mr. Ciambriello and the alleged victim 14 15 in a cafeteria type setting having a soda? 16 Α. I don't recall that. 17 MR. ARDITO: No further questions, 18 judge. 19 THE COURT: Ms. Veenstra? 20 MS. VEENSTRA: Nothing further of this 21 witness. 22 THE COURT: All right. Thank you very 23 much. 24 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 25 THE COURT: You may step down.